

APPENDIX: Tabulated findings from the national survey

Table 1: Employability Skills Framework

Personal attributes that contribute to overall employability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Loyalty ❖ Commitment ❖ Honesty and integrity ❖ Enthusiasm ❖ Reliability ❖ Personal presentation ❖ Common sense 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Positive self-esteem ❖ Sense of humour ❖ Balanced attitude to work and home life ❖ Ability to deal with pressure ❖ Motivation ❖ Adaptability
Skill	Element	
Communication that contributes to productive and harmonious relations between employees and customers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Listening and understanding ❖ Speaking clearly and directly ❖ Writing to suit the needs of the audience ❖ Negotiating responsively ❖ Reading independently ❖ Empathising ❖ Using numeracy effectively ❖ Understanding the needs of internal and external customers ❖ Persuading effectively ❖ Establishing and using networks ❖ Being assertive ❖ Sharing information ❖ Speaking and writing in languages other than English 	
Teamwork that contributes to productive working relationships and outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Working with people of different ages, gender, race, religion or political persuasion ❖ Working as an individual and as a member of a team ❖ Knowing how to define a role as part of a team ❖ Applying teamwork skills to a range of situations e.g. futures planning, crisis problem-solving ❖ Identifying the strengths of team members ❖ Coaching, mentoring and giving feedback 	
Problem-solving that contributes to productive outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Developing creative, innovative solutions ❖ Developing practical solutions ❖ Showing independence and initiative in identifying problems and solving them ❖ Solving problems in teams ❖ Applying a range of strategies to problem-solving ❖ Using mathematics, including budgeting and financial management to solve problems ❖ Applying problem-solving strategies across a range of areas ❖ Testing assumptions taking the context of data and circumstances into account 	

Initiative and enterprise that contribute to innovative outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Resolving customer concerns in relation to complex project Issues ❖ Adapting to new situations ❖ Developing a strategic, creative, long-term vision ❖ Being creative ❖ Identifying opportunities not obvious to others ❖ Translating ideas into action ❖ Generating a range of options ❖ Initiating innovative solutions
Planning and organising that contribute to long-term and short-term strategic planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Managing time and priorities—setting timelines, coordinating tasks for self and with others ❖ Being resourceful ❖ Taking initiative and making decisions ❖ Adapting resource allocations to cope with contingencies ❖ Establishing clear project goals and deliverables ❖ Allocating people and other resources to tasks ❖ Planning the use of resources including time management ❖ Participating in continuous improvement and planning processes ❖ Developing a vision and proactive plan to accompany it ❖ Predicting—weighing up risk, evaluating alternatives and applying evaluation criteria ❖ Collecting, analysing and organising information ❖ Understanding basic business systems and their relationships
Self-management that contributes to employee satisfaction and growth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Having a personal vision and goals ❖ Evaluating and monitoring own performance ❖ Having knowledge and confidence in own ideas and vision ❖ Articulating own ideas and vision ❖ Taking responsibility
Learning that contributes to ongoing improvement and expansion in employee and company operations and outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ Managing own learning ❖ Contributing to the learning community at the workplace ❖ Using a range of media to learn—mentoring, peer support, networking, information technology (IT) courses ❖ Applying learning to ‘technical’ issues (e.g. learning about products) and ‘people’ issues (e.g. interpersonal and cultural aspects of work) ❖ Having enthusiasm for ongoing learning ❖ Being willing to learn in any setting—on and off the job ❖ Being open to new ideas and techniques ❖ Being prepared to invest time and effort in learning new skills ❖ Acknowledging the need to learn in order to accommodate Change

Technology that contributes to effective execution of tasks

- ❖ Having a range of basic information technology skills
- ❖ Applying information technology as a management tool
- ❖ Using information technology to organise data
- ❖ Being willing to learn new information technology skills
- ❖ Having the occupational health and safety knowledge to apply technology
- ❖ Having the appropriate physical capacity

Source: Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry & Business Council of Australia (2002, p.8)

Table 2: Location of respondents (Instructor, trainee, training provider and employer sample)

Location	Respondent type							
	Training Providers		Employers		Instructors		Trainees	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Thimphu	10	62.5	10	35.71			20	18.52
Punakha	1	6.25			7	35	88	81.48
WangduePhodrang	2	12.5	1	3.57	11	55		
Trashigang			1	3.57	2	10		
Haa	1	6.25						
Sarpang	1	6.25	9	32.14				
Bumthang	1	6.25	1	3.57				
Mongar			1	3.57				
Paro			2	7.14				
Pemagatshel			1	3.57				
Samdrupjongkhar			1	3.57				
Tsirang			1	3.57				
Total	16	18.75	28	100.0	20	100.0	108	100.0

Table 3: Type of institution (Instructors, trainee, employer sample)

Location	Respondent type					
	Employers		Instructors		Trainees	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Government	11	40.74	21	100	106	98
Private	8	29.63	0	0	2	2
Corporate	6	22.22	0	0	0	0
Others	2	7.41	0	0	0	0
Total	27	100.0	21	100.0	108	100.0

Table 4: Level of Trainees (Instructor, trainee, employer sample)

Level of trainees	Employers		Training Providers		Instructors		Trainees	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
National Certificate Level 1	3	5.77	5	31.25	18	51.43	0	0
National Certificate Level 2	13	25.00	7	43.75	17	48.57	108	100
National Certificate Level 3	5	9.62	0	0	0	0	0	0
General TVET Graduate	18	34.62	0	0	0	0	0	0
Diploma	13	25.00	3	18.75	0	0	0	0
Others	0	0	1	6.25	0	0	0	0
Total	52	100.0	16	100.0	35	100.0	108	100.0

Table 5: Teaching Delivery Mode (Training provider, Instructor sample)

Delivery Mode	Training providers		Instructors	
	N	%	N	%
Face to face classroom teaching	6	37.5	4	19.05
In the workplace	1	6.25	3	14.29
Online	0	0	0	0.00
Mixed mode	8	50	14	66.67
Others	1	6.25	0	0
Total	16	100.0	21	100.0

Table 6: TVET graduate employment type (Employer sample)

Employment type	N	%
Full time	21	70.00
Part time	4	13.33
Contract	5	16.67
Total	30	100.0

Table 7: Sector of employment (Employer sample)

Sector	N	%
Automobile	6	16.67
Construction	12	33.33
Power	12	33.33
Pharmacy	1	2.78
Steel fabrication	1	2.78
Mechanical	1	2.78
Information Technology	3	8.33
Total	36	100.0

Table 8: Offers (employer sample)

Offers	N	%
On the Job Training	28	87.5
Part time job	4	12.5
Total	32	100

Table 9: Employment type (Instructor sample)

Employment Type	N	%
Regular	21	100
Contract	0	0
Total	21	100.0

Table 10: Traineeship/Apprenticeship (Trainee sample)

	N	%
No	1	0.926
Yes traineeship	101	93.52
Yes apprenticeship	6	5.556
Total	108	100

Table 11: Course (Trainee sample)

	N	%
Automobile Engineering	20	18.69
Electrical Engineering	87	81.31
Total	107	100

Table 12: Progress of training (Trainee sample)

% completed	N	%
10	1	0.93
20	6	5.61
30	20	18.69
40	16	14.95
50	15	14.02
60	6	5.61
70	17	15.89
80	15	14.02
90	9	8.41
100	2	1.87
Total	107	100.0

Table 13: Knowledge of skills (Percent indicating they fully know and understand the term - employer, training provider and instructor sample)

	Percent (%)		
	Employers	Training Providers	Instructors
i. Generic Skills	57.69	62.5	60
ii. Mayer Competencies	23.08	20	10
iii. Core Skills	48.00	73.33	57.14
iv. Soft skills	46.15	62.5	57.14
v. Hard skills	40.00	56.25	23.81
vi. Transferable skills	44.44	62.5	38.1
vii. Work skills	77.78	82.5	57.14
viii. Employability skills	68.00	74	42.86
ix. Life skills	57.69	62.5	35

Table 14: Knowledge of skills (Percent indicating they heard of each term - trainee sample)

	Yes
i. Generic Skills	44.12
ii. Core Skills	36.73
iii. Key competencies	57.73
iv. Employability skills	70.87

Table 15: Rating of skills (Percent indicating each skill as "Very important [VImp]" "and Important [Imp]"- employer, training provider, instructor and trainee sample)

	Employer		Training Provider		Instructor		Trainee	
	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp
Being able to read, spell and write well	50.00	92.86	37.50	87.50	52.38	90.48	75.00	98.15
Being able to use mathematical ideas and techniques	60.71	85.71	25.00	81.25	28.57	80.95	74.07	97.22
Being able to solve problems	57.14	96.43	37.50	81.25	30.00	100.00	77.36	96.23
Being able to use information technology	57.14	92.86	37.50	81.25	42.86	76.19	76.42	97.17
Being able to understand how ideas and systems are linked to each other	60.71	100.00	40.00	100.00	47.62	80.95	76.64	97.20
Being able to collect, analyse and organise information	46.43	78.57	37.50	87.50	38.10	71.43	71.03	96.26
Being able to speak and communicate well with other people	67.86	92.86	56.25	81.25	61.90	100.00	66.67	99.07
Being able to understand and communicate with people from other cultures	32.14	82.14	37.50	81.25	19.05	76.19	52.34	91.59
Being able to work with other people in teams	60.71	100.00	56.25	93.75	66.67	95.24	79.63	98.15
Being able to build and manage a team of people	40.74	96.30	62.50	93.75	23.81	80.95	69.44	99.07
Being able to solve conflicts	21.43	78.57	50.00	81.25	23.81	80.95	62.96	94.44
Being a good manager of their time	57.14	89.29	43.75	87.50	38.10	90.48	70.09	97.20
Having a customer focus	39.29	89.29	43.75	81.25	47.62	80.95	66.36	97.20
Being creative and innovative in their thinking	60.71	100.00	50.00	100.00	47.62	90.48	76.64	97.20
Being able to reflect upon what and how they learn	35.71	100.00	56.25	100.00	42.86	85.71	62.04	96.30
Being able to plan and organise activities	39.29	92.86	50.00	93.75	28.57	90.48	77.78	98.15

	Employer		Training Provider		Instructor		Trainee	
	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp	VImp	Imp
Having work and study skills	42.86	89.29	31.25	87.50	28.57	100.00	73.83	99.07
Having a practical focus	46.43	100.00	56.25	87.50	66.67	95.24	85.05	100.00
Being self-confident	66.67	100.00	68.75	93.75	52.38	95.24	86.79	99.06
Being able to change how they think and behave	28.57	92.86	37.50	87.50	33.33	95.24	55.14	95.33
Being able to complete a task when there is incomplete information	33.33	88.89	25.00	81.25	23.81	76.19	50.00	87.74
Knowing how they learn best about new skills or ideas	35.71	96.43	56.25	87.50	42.86	95.24	70.48	98.10
Being ethical	22.22	92.59	53.33	86.67	47.62	85.71	59.22	97.09
Being able to challenge how things are done	35.71	96.43	33.33	100.00	38.10	90.48	76.19	99.05
Being motivated	64.29	92.86	50.00	100.00	57.14	95.24	72.12	99.04
Being adaptable to change at work	60.71	100.00	50.00	100.00	52.38	100.00	67.62	99.05

Table 16: Per cent of respondents listing skills as taught well, taught poorly, and important for a job in their industry (employer, training provider, instructor, trainee sample)

	Taught well (%)				Taught Poorly (%)				Important in industry (%)			
	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai
1. Being able to read, spell and write well	1.80	1.33	<u>8.57</u>	3.90	<u>7.92</u>	1.54	1.67	1.56	3.54	3.75	4.35	4.86
2. Being able to use mathematical ideas and techniques	2.70	1.33	1.43	2.67	<u>5.94</u>	3.08	1.67	4.43	3.54	1.25	1.45	1.95
3. Being able to solve problems	<u>7.21</u>	4.00	1.43	3.29	0.99	<u>7.69</u>	1.67	4.17	<u>8.85</u>	<u>8.75</u>	4.35	4.47
4. Being able to use information technology	4.50	4.00	1.43	2.87	4.95	<u>6.15</u>	0.00	<u>5.47</u>	3.54	2.50	1.45	3.70
5. Being able to understand how ideas and systems are linked to each other	<u>7.21</u>	2.67	2.86	4.72	0.99	3.08	0.00	3.65	<u>6.19</u>	1.25	1.45	2.72
6. Being able to collect, analyse and organise information	0.90	<u>8.00</u>	2.86	4.11	3.96	1.54	<u>8.33</u>	5.47	0.88	3.75	1.45	2.53
7. Being able to speak and communicate well with other people	1.80	<u>6.67</u>	4.29	5.34	<u>6.93</u>	4.62	3.33	2.08	1.77	<u>7.50</u>	1.45	4.47
8. Being able to understand and communicate with people from other cultures	1.80	<u>6.67</u>	5.71	1.44	<u>5.94</u>	4.62	1.67	<u>4.95</u>	0.88	5.00	0.00	3.11
9. Being able to work with other people in teams	8.11	2.67	<u>7.14</u>	<u>6.16</u>	0.99	<u>7.69</u>	1.67	2.08	<u>7.96</u>	5.00	0.00	3.50
10. Being able to build and manage a team of people	1.80	5.33	2.86	1.44	4.95	3.08	3.33	4.69	1.77	3.75	1.45	3.89
11. Being able to solve conflicts	3.60	4.00	1.43	1.44	<u>5.94</u>	<u>6.15</u>	0.00	4.69	2.65	5.00	1.45	2.53

	Taught well (%)				Taught Poorly (%)				Important in industry (%)			
	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai	Emp	Trng Pvder	Ins	Trai
12. Being a good manager of their time	3.60	5.33	2.86	3.08	<u>7.92</u>	4.62	<u>6.67</u>	4.69	1.77	1.25	1.45	3.11
13. Having a customer focus	<u>6.31</u>	2.67	<u>7.14</u>	2.26	3.96	3.08	<u>10.00</u>	3.65	<u>8.85</u>	0.00	<u>7.25</u>	2.14
14. Being creative and innovative in their thinking	<u>8.11</u>	<u>6.67</u>	4.29	4.11	4.95	1.54	<u>11.67</u>	2.60	5.31	<u>7.50</u>	<u>10.14</u>	3.70
15. Being able to reflect upon what and how they learn	1.80	5.33	1.43	2.05	2.97	1.54	1.67	<u>6.77</u>	0.88	3.75	1.45	1.17
16. Being able to plan and organise activities	3.60	1.33	4.29	3.90	7.92	3.08	0.00	4.17	3.54	1.25	2.90	3.70
17. Having work and study skills	4.50	4.00	2.86	<u>8.83</u>	1.98	4.62	3.33	3.91	3.54	2.50	4.35	<u>6.03</u>
18. Having a practical focus	<u>7.21</u>	4.00	<u>11.43</u>	<u>9.03</u>	0.00	<u>6.15</u>	0.00	3.39	4.42	3.75	<u>7.25</u>	<u>6.42</u>
19. Being self-confident	5.41	<u>9.33</u>	<u>7.14</u>	<u>8.83</u>	1.98	1.54	3.33	2.08	4.42	<u>7.50</u>	4.35	<u>10.31</u>
20. Being able to change how they think and behave	2.70	0.00	2.86	2.26	2.97	4.62	3.33	<u>4.95</u>	0.88	0.00	1.45	2.53
21. Being able to complete a task when there is incomplete information	0.90	1.33	1.43	2.26	2.97	0.00	<u>6.67</u>	<u>6.51</u>	2.65	1.25	1.45	0.58
22. Knowing how they learn best about new skills or ideas	3.60	1.33	2.86	3.29	0.99	0.00	5.00	3.65	4.42	3.75	5.80	3.31
23. Being ethical	2.70	2.67	2.86	1.85	3.96	3.08	8.33	1.82	5.31	<u>10.00</u>	<u>7.25</u>	1.75
24. Being able to challenge how things are done	0.90	5.33	0.00	<u>5.54</u>	1.98	<u>7.69</u>	<u>6.67</u>	2.86	1.77	2.50	1.45	<u>6.61</u>
25. Being motivated	4.50	2.67	5.71	3.49	3.96	1.54	5.00	1.82	<u>6.19</u>	5.00	<u>14.49</u>	<u>6.23</u>
26. Being adaptable to change at work	2.70	1.33	2.86	1.85	1.98	<u>7.69</u>	5.00	3.91	4.42	2.50	<u>10.14</u>	4.67

Table 17: General Attitude (Percent agreeing to each statement - Employer sample)

	% Strongly Agree	% Agree
I believe I am very clear in understanding why it is important to learn generic skills	40.74	92.59
I have heard of the National Competency standards, National Assessments and National Certificates	21.43	64.29
Students only want to learn the skills that they believe are relevant to the job or industry they want to work in	10.71	60.71
Students want to learn a broad set of skills that will allow them to change jobs or industries	21.43	71.43
My industry wants TVET graduates who have broad generic skills rather than only specialist/technical skills	40.74	85.19
The TVET graduates I employ are highly employable in a range of jobs in different industries	25.93	81.48
I believe that the generic skills should be taught in the Institutes	29.63	81.48
I believe that the generic skills can be learnt at the workplace and therefore the institutes should only focus on technical trainings	35.71	60.71

Table 18: General Attitude (Percent agreeing to each statement - trainee sample)

	% Strongly Agree	% Agree
Teachers are very clear in explaining why it is important to be learning certain skills	38.32	81.31
I enjoy the activities we do in class to help us develop new skills	62.04	96.3
I understand how the assessment is used to test if I have achieved competence or not in a new skill	32.08	83.96
I only want to learn skills that are relevant to the job or industry I want to work in	27.78	62.04
I want to learn a broad set of skills that will allow me to change jobs or industries if and when I want to	61.68	86.92
I think our teachers are innovative in how they help us learn new skills	34.26	87.04
Teachers have a very practical focus in what they teach us	42.59	84.26

Table 19: General Attitude (Percent agreeing to each statement - Training provider and instructor sample)

	Training Provider		Instructor	
	% Strongly Agree	% Agree	% Strongly Agree	% Agree
I believe I am very clear in explaining why it is important to learn generic skills	50	81.25	60.00	75.00
Students understand how the assessment is being used to test if they have achieved competence in a generic skill	25	81.25	5.88	47.06
Students only want to learn the skills that will allow them to change jobs or industries	61.25	100	26.32	68.42
My Industry wants students who have broad set of skills that will allow them to change jobs or industries	33.33	73.33	11.11	44.44
My industry wants students who have broad generic skills rather than only specialist skills	31.25	68.75	10.53	31.58
I assess and report on generic skills	7.69	76.92	0.00	44.44
Our NCS clearly describes the generic skills required. The competence based standards for industry does a good job in embedding generic skills:				
- in the content	21.43	50	6.25	75.00
- in the processes described	7.14	71.43	0.00	43.75
- in the assessment guidelines	7.14	64.29	0.00	58.82
-in the underpinning skills and knowledge	21.46	64.29	0.00	50.00
Our industry training package (Competency standard and the curriculum) is helping to produce graduates who are highly employable in a range of jobs in different industries	20	80	0.00	27.78
There are guidelines in the Competency standard that help me assess generic skill development in my students	14.29	85.71	0.00	29.41